

# HISTORIC LANDMARKS ADVISORY COMMISSION APPROVED MINUTES

# Special Hearing/Site Visit of August 22, 2007 1:00 p.m.

The regular hearing of the Santa Barbara County Historic Landmarks Commission was called to order by Chair Eileen Wyckoff, at 1:20 p.m., at the Entrance Kiosk, Santa Barbara Botanic Garden, 1212 Mission Canyon Road, Santa Barbara, California.

#### COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

Barbara Lowenthal1st DistrictSue Adams1st DistrictJohn Woodward1st District, At-Large MemberDeborah L. Schwartz2nd DistrictJames Lowsley4th DistrictEileen Wyckoff4th District, Chair

#### COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:

Michael Cervin	2 <sup>nd</sup> District
Randy Melcombe	3 <sup>rd</sup> District

#### STAFF MEMBERS PRESENT:

Michelle Gibbs, HLAC Planner Kevin Ready, Deputy County Counsel

**<u>REPORTERS</u>**: KEYT and Santa Barbara Independent

NUMBER OF INTERESTED PERSONS: Approximately 56

## ADMINISTRATIVE AGENDA

- 1. ROLL CALL: Commissioners Cervin, Melcombe, and Stotts were absent.
- 2. **PUBLIC COMMENT**: None.

#### **DISCUSSION ITEM:**

**3.** The County's Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) will review and discuss the Botanic Garden's Substantial Conformity Determination under Case No. 72-CP-116, dated July 18, 2007, for the installation of a "Meadow Terrace." The project involves installation of a three-tiered exhibit and events plaza area with three low level rock retaining walls defining the levels, and a surface in a flagstone rock treatment. The total project area is approximately 4,205 square feet, with planting beds along the edge of each retaining wall and sandstone flagstones making up the terraces. A total of 240 linear feet of retaining walls is proposed. The maximum exposed height of the retaining walls is 18 inches. The project involves less than 50 cubic yards of cut and/or fill. The project site is the former site of a large oak tree that was diseased and recently removed on the west side of the Meadow. The project is located in an area that is part of the historic landscape design concept of the Botanic Garden which is designated as part of County Historic Landmark #24 (Board of Supervisors Resolution 2003-059). The subject parcel is 12.83 acres in the REC zone and is shown as Assessor's Parcel

Number 023-340-015, located at 1212 Mission Canyon Road, in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District.

ACTION: Commissioner Lowsley moved, seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and carried by a 6-0 vote (Cervin, Melcombe, and Stotts absent) to continue the item as a decision item to the HLAC meeting of September 10, 2007.

### **HLAC COMMENTS:**

- All six commissioners stated that the resolution (Resolution No. 2003-059) for County Landmark #24, known as the "SANTA BARBARA BOTANIC GARDEN, MISSION DAM AND AQUEDUCT," includes the historic landscape design concept of the meadow in its designation of the landmark.
- All six commissioners stated that the "Meadow Terrace" project is a substantial deviation from the historic landscape design concept of the meadow and is a substantial deviation from the historic use of the meadow.
- All six commissioners believe that the project must come before the HLAC for their decision on the project.

## **DECISION ITEM:**

- 4. The County's Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC) will receive a status update from staff on the Santa Barbara Botanic Garden Vital Mission Plan Draft EIR. The Santa Barbara Botanic Garden's Vital Mission Plan project affects several parts of County Historic Landmark #24 (Board of Supervisors Resolution 2003-059). HLAC will discuss and decide on how HLAC intends to comment on the historic resource sections of the Draft EIR. The subject parcel is 12.83 acres in the REC zone and is shown as Assessor's Parcel Number 023-340-015, located at 1212 Mission Canyon Road, in the Mission Canyon area, First Supervisorial District.
  - ACTION: Commissioner Adams moved, seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and carried by a 6-0 vote (Cervin, Melcombe, and Stotts absent) to elect Commissioner Lowsley to submit a letter (see attachment) to the County Planning and Development Department with the following comments on the Draft Environmental Impact Report for the Botanic Garden's Vital Mission Plan.

#### **HLAC COMMENTS:**

- It is of the opinion of the HLAC that the analysis of impacts on cultural and historical resources in the Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR) for the Santa Barbara Botanic Garden's Vital Mission Plan is inadequate and that the Draft EIR should be revised and recirculated. Specifically, the following should be completed:
  - **1.** A Phase 2 and Phase 3 historic resource report should be prepared for the proposed project and the results incorporated into the Draft EIR.
  - 2. The HLAC has not had adequate meeting time to discuss the EIR. The HLAC would like to provide input on the mitigation measures required in the Draft EIR.
  - **3.** The Gane House is a significant historic resource that has the potential to be a County Historic Landmark. The Draft EIR should evaluate potential impacts on this historic resource.
  - 4. The meadow terrace is part of County Historic Landmark #24. The Draft EIR does not address potential impacts on this part of the Landmark. The Draft EIR should evaluate potential impacts of the proposed project on the meadow terrace.

The "Meadow Terrace" project should also be evaluated as part of the overall Vital Mission Plan project in the Draft EIR.

- 5. Once the Caretaker's Cottage is relocated and renovated, it should remain as part of County Historic Landmark #24.
- 5. Next Meeting of the Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission
  - ACTION: Commissioner Wyckoff moved, seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and carried by a 6-0 vote (Commissioners Cervin, Melcombe, and Stotts absent) that the meeting be adjourned until 10:00 A.M. on Monday, September 10, 2007 in the Santa Barbara County Administration/Engineering Building Complex, Board of Supervisors Conference Room, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, 105 East Anapamu Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101.

In the event HLAC holds a special meeting before the September 10, 2007 meeting, notice of such special meeting will be provided pursuant to California Government Code Section 54956.

Respectfully submitted by,

David Villalobos Secretary for HLAC

 $G:\GROUP\PC\_STAFF\WP\HLAC\MINUTES\Minutes--2007\08-22-07\min.doc$ 

# JAMES P. LOWSLEY

174 Oakmont Ave. Lompoc, CA 93436-1311 805-733-5516

Alex Tuttle Santa Barbara County Planning and Development 123 E. Anapamu Street Santa Barbara, CA 93101

Dear Mr. Tuttle:

I am one of the Commissioners appointed to the Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission (HLAC). On Aug 22, 2007, the Commission held a special meeting at the Botanic Garden. At that meeting, I was appointed to draft a letter to you concerning the Commission's comments about the Draft Environmental Impact Report (EIR) (07EIR-00000-00001). The motion to make these comments was made by Commissioner Adams, amended by Commissioner Woodward, seconded by Commissioner Schwartz and passed unanimously six to zero with Commissioners Melcombe and Cervin absent. This correspondence is a summary of our discussion.

It is the opinion of the Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission that the analysis of impacts on cultural and historical resources in the Draft EIR for the Santa Barbara Botanic Garden's Vital Mission Plan is inadequate and that the Draft EIR should be revised and recirculated. Specifically, the following should be completed:

- 1. A Phase 2 and Phase 3 historic resource report should be prepared for the proposed project and the results incorporated into the Draft EIR.
- 2. The HLAC would like to provide input concerning the mitigation required in the Draft EIR.
- 3. The Gane House is a significant historic resource that has the potential to be a Santa Barbara County Historic Landmark and, we believe eligible for the Federal designation, and should be evaluated for potential impacts on this historic resource.
- 4. The meadow terrace is a part of County Historic Landmark #24. The Draft EIR does not address potential impacts on this party of the Landmark. Also the Draft EIR should address the Meadow Terrace Exhibit project as an overall part of the Vital Mission Plan in the Draft EIR.
- 5. We understand that a part of the overall plan is to relocate the Caretaker's Cottage and renovate it. Once this is accomplished, the Caretaker's Cottage should remain a part of County Landmark #24.

- 6. The Vital Mission Plan encompasses 85 acres where the Draft EIR only addresses 79 Acres.
- 7. There is a Native American painting approximately 140 meters from the dam that has not been addressed in the Draft EIR.

The HLAC would be happy to comment on the recirculated Draft EIR when it is available. The Botanic Garden is a valuable historic resource for all of Santa Barbara County and should be preserved and potential impacts from projects should be minimized.

Sincerely, s/ James P. Lowsley HLAC Commissioner, 4<sup>th</sup> District